arXiv:1302.2358v1 [math.AG] 10 Feb 2013

A REAL NULLSTELLENSATZ FOR FREE MODULES

J. CIMPRIČ

Abstract. Noncommutative Real Algebraic Geometry comes in two flavors, one-sided and two-sided. While the two-sided theory is already well developed for various kinds of noncommutative polynomials, the one-sided theory has been limited so far mostly to the study of free polynomials. The main contribution of this paper is the proof of a one-sided Real Nullstellensatz for matrix polynomials. A reformulation of this result, which we call the Real Nullstellensatz for free modules, may also be interesting to the commutative theory. We first prove this reformulation by induction on the rank of the free module by using the commutative Real Nullstellensatz of Dubois, Risler and Efroymson as induction base.

1. Introduction

The Real Nullstellensatz of Dubois [5], Risler [8] and Efroymson [6] (our Theorem 1) is a cornerstone of Real Algebraic Geometry. Its role is the same as the role of Hilbert's Nullstellensatz in Complex Algebraic Geometry. The proofs, however, are completely different.

The aim of this paper is to present two generalizations of the Real Nullstellensatz. We call them the Real Nullstellensatz for free modules (our Theorem 2) and the one-sided Real Nullstellensatz for matrices (our Theorem 3). The motivation for Theorem 3 comes from the one-sided Noncommutatative Real Algebraic Geometry [7, 3, 4, 2, 9]. In [3, Section 6] we proved Theorem 3 for matrix polynomials in one variable. The two-sided version of Theorem 3 has already been proved in [1] by using the ideas from [10]. Theorem 2 is just a reformulation of Theorem 3 but we believe that it is of independent interest. We deduce Theorem 2 from Theorem 1 by induction on the rank of the free module.

To formulate Theorem 1 and to motivate our definitions, we first recall the classical setup. Let R be a a finitely generated commutative unital $\mathbb{R}$-algebra. We will write $V_{\mathbb{R}}(R)$ for the set of all $\mathbb{R}$-algebra homomorphisms from R to $\mathbb{R}$. By the Artin-Lang homomorphism theorem,

---

Date: February 12, 2013.

1991 *Mathematics Subject Classification.* 14P, 13J30.

Key words and phrases. matrix polynomials, real algebraic geometry, real nullstellensatz.

$V_{\mathbb{R}}(R)$ is nonempty if and only if $-1 \notin \sum R^2$. If $R = \mathbb{R}[x_1, \ldots, x_d]$ for some d then $V_{\mathbb{R}}(R)$ can be identified with $\mathbb{R}^d$.

For every ideal I of R we define its **real zero set** by

$$Z_{\mathbb{R}}(I) := \{\phi \in V_{\mathbb{R}}(R) \mid \phi(g) = 0 \text{ for all } g \in I\}$$

and its **real saturation** by

$$\sqrt[\mathcal{E}]{I} := \{f \in R \mid \phi(f) = 0 \text{ for all } \phi \in Z_{\mathbb{R}}(I)\}.$$

Recall that an ideal J of R is **real** if for every $r_1, \ldots, r_K \in R$ such that $\sum_{i=1}^K r_i^2 \in J$ we have that $r_1, \ldots, r_K \in J$. The **real radical** $\sqrt[\text{real}]{I}$ of an ideal I of R is by definition the smallest real ideal which contains I. It is easy to show that

$$\sqrt[\text{real}]{I} = \left\{ f \in R \mid \begin{array}{c} f^{2k} + \sum_{i=1}^L s_i^2 \in I \text{ for some } L \in \mathbb{N} \\ \text{and some } s_1, \ldots, s_L \in R \end{array} \right\}. \tag{1}$$

Theorem 1 (Real Nullstellensatz)**.** *For every ideal I of R,*

$$\sqrt[\mathcal{E}]{I} = \sqrt[\text{real}]{I}.$$

2. A Real Nullstellensatz for free modules

Let n be a fixed integer and let M be the free R-module of rank n, i.e. $M = R^n$. We would like to generalize Theorem 1 to submodules of M. Let $V_{\mathbb{R}}(M)$ be the set of all pairs $(\phi, \mathbf{u})$ where $\phi \in V_{\mathbb{R}}(R)$ and $\mathbf{u} \in \mathbb{R}^n$. For every submodule N of M we define its **real zero set**

$$Z_{\mathbb{R}}(N) := \{(\phi, \mathbf{u}) \in V_{\mathbb{R}}(M) \mid \langle \phi^n(\mathbf{g}), \mathbf{u} \rangle = 0 \text{ for every } \mathbf{g} \in N\}$$

and its **real saturation**

$$\sqrt[\mathcal{E}]{N} := \{\mathbf{f} \in M \mid \langle \phi^n(\mathbf{f}), \mathbf{u} \rangle = 0 \text{ for all } (\phi, \mathbf{u}) \in Z_{\mathbb{R}}(N)\}.$$

Here $\phi^n(\mathbf{h})$ means that we apply ϕ componentwise to $\mathbf{h}$ and $\langle \cdot, \cdot \rangle$ is the standard inner product on $\mathbb{R}^n$, hence $\langle \phi^n(\mathbf{h}), \mathbf{u} \rangle = \sum_{i=1}^n \phi(h_i) u_i$.

We say that a submodule N of M is **real** if for every $\mathbf{m}_1, \ldots, \mathbf{m}_K \in M$ such that $\sum_{i=1}^K \mathbf{m}_i \otimes \mathbf{m}_i \in M \otimes N + N \otimes M$ we have that $\mathbf{m}_1, \ldots, \mathbf{m}_K \in N$. (Here we consider $M \otimes N$ and $N \otimes M$ as submodules of $M \otimes M$ and all tensor products are over R.) For every submodule N of M there exists the smallest real submodule of M which contains it. We will denote it by $\sqrt[\text{real}]{N}$ and call it the **real radical** of N.

An analogue of formula (1) exists but it is more complicated. We have to introduce first an **auxiliary radical**

$$\sqrt[\alpha]{N} = \left\{ \mathbf{f} \in M \mid \begin{array}{c} \mathbf{f} \otimes \mathbf{f} + \sum_{i=1}^L \mathbf{s}_i \otimes \mathbf{s}_i \in M \otimes N + N \otimes M \\ \text{for some } L \in \mathbb{N} \text{ and } \mathbf{s}_1, \ldots, \mathbf{s}_L \in M \end{array} \right\}. \tag{2}$$

Clearly, the set $\sqrt[\alpha]{N}$ is a submodule of M and

$$\sqrt[\text{real}]{N} = N \cup \sqrt[\alpha]{N} \cup \sqrt[\alpha]{\sqrt[\alpha]{N}} \cup \ldots . \tag{3}$$

Here is the main result of this paper:

Theorem 2. *For every submodule N of R^n*

$$\sqrt[\mathcal{E}]{N} = \sqrt[\text{real}]{N}.$$

Proof. To prove the inclusion $\sqrt[\text{real}]{N} \subseteq \sqrt[\mathcal{E}]{N}$ it suffices to show that $\sqrt[\mathcal{E}]{N}$ is a real submodule of R^n containing N. Suppose that

$$\sum_i \mathbf{s}_i \otimes \mathbf{s}_i \in M \otimes \sqrt[\mathcal{E}]{N} + \sqrt[\mathcal{E}]{N} \otimes M.$$

If $\langle \phi^n(N), \mathbf{u} \rangle = 0$ for some $(\phi, \mathbf{u}) \in V_{\mathbb{R}}(R)$, then also $\sum_i \langle \phi^n(\mathbf{s}_i), \mathbf{u} \rangle^2 = \langle (\phi^n \otimes \phi^n)(\sum_i \mathbf{s}_i \otimes \mathbf{s}_i)), \mathbf{u} \otimes \mathbf{u} \rangle \in \langle \phi^n(M) \otimes \phi^n(N) + \phi^n(N) \otimes \phi^n(M), \mathbf{u} \otimes \mathbf{u} \rangle = \langle \phi^n(M), \mathbf{u} \rangle \langle \phi^n(N), \mathbf{u} \rangle + \langle \phi^n(N), \mathbf{u} \rangle \langle \phi^n(M), \mathbf{u} \rangle = 0$. It follows that $\langle \phi^n(\mathbf{s}_i), \mathbf{u} \rangle = 0$ for every i, and so, $\mathbf{s}_i \in \sqrt[\mathcal{E}]{N}$ for every i.

We will prove the opposite inclusion, $\sqrt[\mathcal{E}]{N} \subseteq \sqrt[\text{real}]{N}$, by induction on n. The case $n = 1$ clearly follows from Theorem 1. Suppose now that the inclusion holds for every submodule of R^{n-1} and take any submodule N of $M = R^n$.

Since R is Noetherian, so is M. In particular, N is finitely generated, i.e. there exist $\mathbf{g}_1, \ldots, \mathbf{g}_m \in M$ such that

$$N = \sum_{i=1}^{m} R\, \mathbf{g}_i.$$

For each $i = 1, \ldots, m$ we write

$$\mathbf{g}_i = \sum_{j=1}^{n} g_{ij} \mathbf{e}_j$$

where $\mathbf{e}_1, \ldots, \mathbf{e}_n$ is the standard basis of M. Now pick any

$$\mathbf{f} = \sum_{j=1}^{n} f_j \mathbf{e}_j \in \sqrt[\mathcal{E}]{N}.$$

The proof that $\mathbf{f} \in \sqrt[\text{real}]{N}$ will be split into two claims.

Claim 1. $g_{kl}\mathbf{f} \in \sqrt[\text{real}]{N}$ for every $k = 1, \ldots, m$ and $l = 1, \ldots, n$.

For simplicity we will prove Claim 1 only for $l = 1$ but the same argument also works for other l. Pick $k = 1, \ldots, m$ and write

$$\mathbf{g}'_i = \sum_{j=2}^{n} (g_{k1} g_{ij} - g_{kj} g_{i1}) \mathbf{e}'_{j-1}$$

for all $i = 1, \ldots, m$, where $\mathbf{e}'_1, \ldots, \mathbf{e}'_{n-1}$ is the standard basis of R^{n-1}. Let N' be the submodule of R^{n-1} generated by $\mathbf{g}'_1, \ldots, \mathbf{g}'_m$. Let us verify that the element

$$\mathbf{f}' = \sum_{j=2}^{n} (g_{k1} f_j - g_{kj} f_1)\mathbf{e}'_{j-1}$$

belongs to $\sqrt[\text{real}]{N'}$.

By the induction hypothesis, it suffices to verify that $\mathbf{f}' \in \sqrt[\mathcal{E}]{N'}$. Suppose that for some $\phi \in V_{\mathbb{R}}(R)$ and some $\mathbf{v} \in R^{n-1}$, we have that

$$\sum_{j=2}^{n} \phi(g_{k1} g_{ij} - g_{kj} g_{i1}) v_{j-1} = 0 \text{ for } i = 1, \ldots, m.$$

Then $\phi(g_{i1})u_1 + \ldots + \phi(g_{in})u_n = 0$ for $u_1 = -\sum_{j=2}^{n} \phi(g_{kj})v_{j-1}$. $u_2 = \phi(g_{k1})v_1, \ldots, u_n = \phi(g_{k1})v_{n-1}$ and all $i = 1, \ldots, m$. Since $\mathbf{f} \in \sqrt[\mathcal{E}]{N}$, it follows that $\phi(f_1)u_1 + \ldots + \phi(f_n)u_n = 0$ which can be rewritten as

$$\sum_{j=2}^{n} \phi(g_{k1} f_j - g_{kj} f_1) v_{j-1} = 0.$$

Let $\iota\colon R^{n-1} \to R^n$ be the natural embedding to the last $n-1$ components. Since $\mathbf{f}' \in \sqrt[\text{real}]{N'}$, it follows that

$$\iota(\mathbf{f}') = \sum_{j=2}^{n} (g_{k1} f_j - g_{kj} f_1)\mathbf{e}_j = g_{k1}\mathbf{f} - f_1 \mathbf{g}_k \in \iota(\sqrt[\text{real}]{N'}). \tag{4}$$

In the next paragraph, we will show that

$$\iota(\sqrt[\text{real}]{N'}) \subseteq \sqrt[\text{real}]{\iota(N')}. \tag{5}$$

On the other hand, $\iota(N')$ is contained in N since it is generated by

$$\iota(\mathbf{g}'_i) = \sum_{j=2}^{n} (g_{k1} g_{ij} - g_{kj} g_{i1})\mathbf{e}_j = g_{k1}\mathbf{g}_i - g_{i1}\mathbf{g}_k \in N \tag{6}$$

for $i = 1, \ldots, m$. Claim 1 follows from (4), (5) and (6) since

$$g_{k1}\mathbf{f} = f_1 \mathbf{g}_k + \iota(\mathbf{f}') \in \sqrt[\text{real}]{N}.$$

Let us show that $N'' := \iota^{-1}(\sqrt[\text{real}]{\iota(N')})$ is a real submodule of $M' = R^{n-1}$. Suppose that $\sum_i \mathbf{h}_i \otimes \mathbf{h}_i \in M' \otimes N'' + N'' \otimes M'$, It follows that $\sum_i \iota(\mathbf{h}_i) \otimes \iota(\mathbf{h}_i) \in \iota(M') \otimes \iota(N'') + \iota(N'') \otimes \iota(M') \subseteq M \otimes \sqrt[\text{real}]{N'} + \sqrt[\text{real}]{N'} \otimes M$. Since $\sqrt[\text{real}]{N'}$ is real, it follows that $\iota(\mathbf{h}_i) \in \sqrt[\text{real}]{N'}$ for all i, and so, $\mathbf{h}_i \in N''$ for all i. Since N'' is real and it contains N', it also contains $\sqrt[\text{real}]{N'}$. This proves (5).

Claim 2. $\mathbf{f} \in \sqrt[\text{real}]{I\mathbf{f}}$ where $I = \sum_{k=1}^m \sum_{l=1}^n Rg_{kl}$.

Since $\mathbf{f} \in \sqrt[\mathcal{E}]{N}$, it follows that for every $j = 1, \ldots, n$ and every $\phi \in V_{\mathbb{R}}(R)$, we have $\phi(f_j) = 0$ whenever $\phi(g_{1j}) = \ldots = \phi(g_{mj}) = 0$. (Pick $\mathbf{u}$ from the standard basis of $\mathbb{R}^n$.) By Theorem 1, there exists an integer t_j and elements $s_{ij} \in R$ such that $f_j^{2t_j} + \sum_i s_{ij}^2 \in I$. If we multiply this with $\mathbf{f} \otimes \mathbf{f} \in M \otimes M$, we get that

$$f_j^{t_j}\mathbf{f} \otimes f_j^{t_j}\mathbf{f} + \sum_i s_{ij}\mathbf{f} \otimes s_{ij}\mathbf{f} \in I(\mathbf{f} \otimes \mathbf{f}) \subseteq M \otimes I\mathbf{f} + I\mathbf{f} \otimes M.$$

It follows that $f_j^{t_j}\mathbf{f} \in \sqrt[\text{real}]{I\mathbf{f}}$ for every $j = 1, \ldots, n$. If t is large enough then $(\sum_{j=1}^n Rf_j)^t \subseteq \sum_{j=1}^n Rf_j^{t_j}$ which implies that

$$(\sum_{j=1}^n Rf_j)^t\mathbf{f} \subseteq (\sum_{j=1}^n Rf_j^{t_j})\mathbf{f} \subseteq \sqrt[\text{real}]{I\mathbf{f}}. \tag{7}$$

On the other hand, $2(\mathbf{h} \otimes \mathbf{h}) = (\sum_{j=1}^n h_j\mathbf{e}_j) \otimes \mathbf{h} + \mathbf{h} \otimes (\sum_{j=1}^n h_j\mathbf{e}_j) = \sum_{j=1}^n (\mathbf{e}_j \otimes h_j\mathbf{h} + h_j\mathbf{h} \otimes \mathbf{e}_j) \in M \otimes (\sum_{j=1}^n Rh_j)\mathbf{h} + (\sum_{j=1}^n Rh_j)\mathbf{h} \otimes M$ for every $\mathbf{h} \in M = R^n$, which implies that $\mathbf{h} \in \sqrt[\text{real}]{(\sum_{j=1}^n Rh_j)\mathbf{h}}$. By induction, it follows that

$$\mathbf{f} \in \sqrt[\text{real}]{(\sum_{j=1}^n Rf_j)^t\mathbf{f}} \tag{8}$$

for every t. Claim 2 follows from (7) and (8). $\square$

If $R = \mathbb{R}[x_1, \ldots, x_d]$ and $g_1, \ldots, g_m, f \in R$ are linear polynomials such that $f(a) = 0$ for every $a \in R^d$ satisfying $g_1(a) = \ldots, g_m(a) = 0$, then f is clearly a linear combination of $g_1, \ldots, g_m$. This observation does not generalize to free modules of rank ≥ 2. Namely, take

$$\mathbf{g}_1 = (x_1, x_1 + x_2), \quad \mathbf{g}_2 = (-x_1, x_1 - x_2), \quad \mathbf{f} = (x_1, 0)$$

from R^2. Note that $\mathbf{g}_1, \mathbf{g_2}$ and $\mathbf{f}$ are linear and that $\mathbf{f}$ is not a linear combination of $\mathbf{g}_1$ and $\mathbf{g}_2$. On the othe hand,

$$\mathbf{f} \in \sqrt[\text{real}]{R\mathbf{g}_1 + R\mathbf{g}_2} \subseteq \sqrt[\mathcal{E}]{R\mathbf{g}_1 + R\mathbf{g}_2}$$

since $\mathbf{f} \otimes \mathbf{f} = \mathbf{r}_1 \otimes \mathbf{g}_1 + \mathbf{g}_1 \otimes \mathbf{r}_1 + \mathbf{r}_2 \otimes \mathbf{g_2} + \mathbf{g}_2 \otimes \mathbf{r}_2$ where $\mathbf{r}_1 = (\frac{x_1 - x_2}{4}, 0)$ and $\mathbf{r}_2 = (\frac{-x_1 - x_2}{4}, 0)$.

3. A one-sided Real Nullstellensatz for Matrices

As the main application of Theorem 2 we prove the one-sided Real Nullstellensatz for matrix polynomials which was already conjectured in [3, Section 6] but it was proved there only in the case of one variable.

Let n be an integer, R a finitely generated commutative unital $\mathbb{R}$-algebra and $\mathcal{A} = M_n(R)$ the algebra of all $n \times n$ matrices over R with transpose as involution. The set $V_\mathbb{R}(\mathcal{A})$ consists of all pairs $(\phi, \mathbf{u})$ where $\phi \in V_\mathbb{R}(R)$ and $\mathbf{u} \in \mathbb{R}^n$. Note that is equal to $V_\mathbb{R}(R^n)$.

For every left ideal J of $\mathcal{A}$, we define its **real zero set**

$$Z_\mathbb{R}(J) := \{(\phi, \mathbf{u}) \in V_\mathbb{R}(\mathcal{A}) \mid \phi_n(G)\mathbf{u} = 0 \text{ for all } G \in J\}$$

($\phi_n(G)$ means that we apply ϕ entrywise to G) and its **real saturation**

$$\sqrt[\mathcal{E}]{J} := \{F \in \mathcal{A} \mid \phi_n(F)\mathbf{u} = 0 \text{ for all } (\phi, \mathbf{u}) \in Z_\mathbb{R}(J)\}.$$

We say that a left ideal J of $\mathcal{A}$ is **real** if for every $H_1, \ldots, H_k \in \mathcal{A}$ such that $H_1^T H_1 + \ldots + H_k^T H_k \in J + J^T$ we have that $H_1, \ldots, H_k \in J$. The smallest real left ideal of $\mathcal{A}$ which contains a given left ideal J of $\mathcal{A}$ is denoted by $\sqrt[\text{real}]{J}$ and called the **real radical** of J. The analogue of formulas (1) and (3) can be found in [3, Section 5].

Theorem 3. *For every left ideal J of $M_n(R)$,*

$$\sqrt[\mathcal{E}]{J} = \sqrt[\text{real}]{J}.$$

Proof. Let N be the set of all rows of all elements of J. Clearly, N is a submodule of $M = R^n$ and

$$J = \begin{bmatrix} N \\ \vdots \\ N \end{bmatrix}.$$

We claim that

$$\sqrt[\mathcal{E}]{J} = \begin{bmatrix} \sqrt[\mathcal{E}]{N} \\ \vdots \\ \sqrt[\mathcal{E}]{N} \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} \sqrt[\text{real}]{N} \\ \vdots \\ \sqrt[\text{real}]{N} \end{bmatrix} = \sqrt[\text{real}]{J}.$$

The first equality is clear from the definitions and the second equality follows from Theorem 2. To prove the third equality, it suffices to show (by a slight abuse of notation) that J is real if and only if N is real. In the following, we will identify $M \otimes M$ with $M_n(R)$ by sending $\mathbf{a} \otimes \mathbf{b}$ into $\mathbf{a}^T\mathbf{b}$. This identification sends $M \otimes N$ into J and $N \otimes M$ into J^T.

Suppose that J is real and $\sum_i \mathbf{m}_i \otimes \mathbf{m}_i \in M \otimes N + N \otimes M$ for some $\mathbf{m}_i \in M$. It follows that $\sum_i \mathbf{m}_i^T \mathbf{m}_i \in J + J^T$. Therefore,

$$\begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{m}_i \\ \vdots \\ 0 \end{bmatrix} \in J$$

for every i. This proves that $\mathbf{m}_i \in N$ for every i, and so, N is real.

Conversely, suppose that N is real and $\sum_i H_i^T H_i \in J + J^T$ for some $H_i \in M_n(R)$. It follows that $\sum_{i,j} \mathbf{h}_{ij}^T \mathbf{h}_{ij} \in J + J^T$ where

$$H_i = \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{h}_{i1} \\ \vdots \\ \mathbf{h}_{in} \end{bmatrix}$$

for every i. It follows that $\sum_{i,j} \mathbf{h}_{ij} \otimes \mathbf{h}_{ij} \in M \otimes N + N \otimes M$. Since N is real, $\mathbf{h}_{ij} \in N$ for all i, j, which shows that $H_i \in J$ for all i. $\square$

References

[1] J. Cimprič, Real algebraic geometry for matrices over commutative rings. J. Algebra 359 (2012), 89-103.

[2] J. Cimprič, Noncommutative Positivstellenstze for pairs representation-vector. Positivity 15 (2011), no. 3, 481-495.

[3] J. Cimprič, J. W. Helton, S. McCullough, C. Nelson, A Non-commutative Real Nullstellensatz Corresponds to a Non-commutative Real Ideal; Algorithms, Proc. London Math. Soc. (2012) doi: 10.1112/plms/pds060 First published online: December 3, 2012

[4] J. Cimprič, J. W. Helton, I. Klep, S. McCullough, C. Nelson, On real one-sided ideals in a free algebra, submitted.

[5] D. W. Dubois, A nullstellensatz for ordered fields, Ark. Mat. 8 (1969), 111–114.

[6] G. Efroymson, Local reality on algebraic varieties, J. Algebra 29 (1974), 113–142.

[7] J. W. Helton, S. McCullough, M. Putinar, Strong majorization in a free $*$-algebra, Math. Z. 255 (2007), no. 3, 579-596.

[8] J.-J. Risler, Une caractérisation des idéaux des variétés algébriques réelles. C.R.A.S. Paris, série A, 271 (1970), 1171–1173.

[9] S. Shankar, The Nullstellensatz for Systems of PDE, Advances in Applied Mathematics 23 (1999), 360–374.

[10] K. Schmüdgen, Noncommutative real algebraic geometry - some basic concepts and first ideas. Emerging applications of algebraic geometry, 325-350, IMA Vol. Math. Appl., 149, Springer, New York, 2009.

JAKA CIMPRIČ, UNIVERSITY OF LJUBLJANA, FACULTY OF MATH. AND PHYS., DEPT. OF MATH., JADRANSKA 19, SI-1000 LJUBLJANA, SLOVENIJA. E-MAIL: CIMPRIC@FMF.UNI-LJ.SI. WWW PAGE: HTTP://WWW.FMF.UNI-LJ.SI/∼CIMPRIC.